

## Threats to Various Components of Human Security Cause Brain Drain in Pakistan

Syed Sibtain Hussain Shah<sup>1,\*</sup> and Arshad Mahmood<sup>2</sup>

### Abstract

*The aim of this research is to investigate different aspects of insecurity which cause the brain drain in Pakistan. The study encompasses the period from 2000 to 2022 covering various threats to human protections such as personal, community, economic and political securities in the country. Using secondary data, the authors applied process tracing method of qualitative approach under applied research model for examining chains of the events related to absence of human security causing brain drain in Pakistan. The study identified the aforementioned characteristics of the human insecurity which exacerbate the brain drain in Pakistan. For example personal security became under threats due to rising violent extremism and terrorism in the post 2000 era. The community security as a part of human security, also faced threats from the violent extremist and militant organizations. The economic insecurity was aggravated by inequitable socio- economic conditions in the country, which trigger brain drain among unemployed youth. The country's political system as a part of political security faced instability and insecurity due to conflictual political environment in the country. The operative environment demands structural reforms in governance and economic paradigms beside political stability for sustained growth. The absolute human security; protection of life, property, socio-economic and above all human dignity should be ensured by the incumbent government(s).*

**Keywords: Human Insecurity, Economic Security, Political Security, Brain Drain, Pakistan**

---

<sup>1</sup>Assistant Professor, Department of International Relations, National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Islamabad, Pakistan.

<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, NUST Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies, National University of Science and Technology, Islamabad, Pakistan.

\* **Corresponding Author:** [drsibtain.numl@gmail.com](mailto:drsibtain.numl@gmail.com)

## **1. Introduction**

The brain drain is an area of serious concern for the developing or underdeveloped world particularly it became a vital fact after World War II (WWII). In the post war era, engineers, scientists and physicians from the various under developed countries headed towards the U.S. and other developed countries for quality education and better economic and social future. The brain drain means, “the emigration of high-level manpower from underdeveloped countries to developed countries, with the explicit purpose of establishing permanent residence in the developed countries” (Truscott, 1971). The highly skilled manpower is being considered as an asset for the countries of their origin because such professionals contribute to enhance technical capacity and enrich the culture of competency in their respective countries. In order to address the shortage of the experts of different fields, the developed world offers beneficial incentives for attracting highly qualified professionals from the underdeveloped and developing countries. By utilizing services of this valuable human capital, the developed world produces high-priced products and exports it to the developing countries. Migration of well qualified labours is yet an important matter of debate in the academia as endeavours of the western countries for attracting the trained professionals are still going on. For example, the European Union has made conscious efforts in the year 2000, wherein UK, Ireland, France and Germany made their policies to attract skilled labour and European Commission fully endorsed these efforts (Truscott, 1971). In this situation, the underdeveloped or developing countries already facing scarcity of expertise of the manpower, lose the high skilled human capital.

Pakistan is among the countries which faces problem of brain drain for a long time (Özden & Schiff, 2005). While, Pakistan benefits from remittances in billions of dollars every year due to overseas Pakistanis but most of the required well experienced and qualified professionals in technological fields are hardly available in the country. The trend of brain drain in Pakistan has increased in 2000s era and authors of this paper set timeframe of 2000-2022, the period covering a significant increase in trend of relocation of professionals of various fields from Pakistan to abroad. According to the media, 765,000 people including 92,000 highly skilled professional such as doctors and engineers left Pakistan for abroad only in 2022 (Ahmed, 2022).

There are many factors behind the migration of the professional and intellectuals from Pakistan in this period and human insecurity is one of the main reasons for this problem in the country witnessing various challenges to the human security for the past many years. This study covers the human insecurity as a major factor towards brain drain in Pakistan. The purpose of this research is to investigate the threats to human protections such as personal, community, economic and political securities in the country facing brain drain for a long time. This study addresses the question, how the aforementioned aspects of human insecurity cause brain drain in Pakistan?

As the core theme of the research is the brain drain from Pakistan and threats to various components of human security causing brain drain in the country, therefore this paper describes the perception of brain drain, the importance of human intellects and human security in the broader concept of the security covering personal, economic,

community and political security of a nation. By gathering and evaluating the secondary data in this study, the authors applied process tracing tool of the qualitative method to respond the aforementioned research question (Intrac, 2017). Information about the chains of happenings and occurrences correlated to brain drain in Pakistan and human insecurity as a main factor in the context have been assessed and examined in the study. Certain Pakistan specific recommendations have also been offered to make this research purposeful.

## **2. Literature Review**

The gap in the current academic work was also among the motives for opting this research topic as there was less attention in the literature on the subject of the human insecurity as a main cause of brain drain in Pakistan. The existing literature encompasses less focus on the dearth of human security as a main factor of fleeing intellectual capital from Pakistan. As minimum scholarly work has been accomplished on the topic, most of the literature is concerning many other causes of drain of intellectual capital from Pakistan and other countries. For instance, an author without naming Pakistan emphasises that the relocation of educated and trained persons from underdeveloped to the developed and rich countries - mostly the United States, the United Kingdom, and Canada has been on the increase during the past decade and a half (Qureshi, 1965). Similarly, another article elaborating the directions of the brain drain of professionals verified that it usually takes place from developing countries to the developed world (Fisher, 2003). Another piece of academic work titled, "Brain Drain or Overflow," concentrating on drain of skilled workers describes, "We know much more about the international migration of professional manpower" (Baldwin, 1970).

The existing literature also discusses the contribution of diaspora community in shape of remittances and describes that the expatriate community may also provide technical assistance to their countries of origin. An author namely Ainali Sahay is of the opinion that diasporic community as an agent of development contributes towards national development beside remittances and technological know-how being disseminated through well established Multinational Corporations (Sahay, 2009). The author further alluded that "policymakers, particularly those in the U.S., have been targeted for importing brain gain from source countries and accumulating human capital" (Sahay, 2009). According to the literature, various push and pull factors are involved in the brain drain from the countries like Pakistan. A Pakistani researcher Nadia Sajjad evaluated the magnitude and causes of brain drain in Pakistan as defining undeniably brain drain in the country increased above 50% in 2000 as compared to 1990s and predominant causes are push and pull factors including adverse economic conditions in the country (Sajjad, 2011).

Indicating another reason of the brain drain, the literature further declares that in the current world, the brain drain takes place due to demands of global talent by some of the advanced countries such as Australia and Canada (Beine et al., 2008). The intellectual drain is also being called permanent migration of the people which could be termed a great human loss of the home country as the literature refers to the permanent or long-duration migration of educated or competent individuals from one country to another, usually from

third world (Sinclair, 1979). Since independence of Pakistan, a number of Pakistani students stayed in the U.S. due to better job opportunities in the country of developed world (Orton, 1982). The academic work verified that it had been happening since a long time in the history of the country, to some extent rooted in the history that the country exports the workforce to other parts of the world (Arif et al., 1997). Study of the existing scholarly work proves that it could not present a wider picture of the brain drain from the Pakistani society and human insecurity as a main factor of this rising trend. Therefore, this research fills up the disparity in the existing literature by a broader analysis of different characteristics of human insecurity causing brain drain in Pakistan.

### **3. Conceptual and Theoretical Framework**

The human security's concept covers dignity and free from fear through the protection and empowerment of all individuals. In a broader definition, the conception of human security involves economic, food, health, environmental, personal, social and community, and political safety of the people from the various threats. Furthermore, "It can generally be understood as the wellbeing of individuals, which may encompass an individual's economic, food, health, environmental, personal and political security" (Connelly & Hama, 2017). The main threats to the human security could be categorized dangers to personal security such as physical violence, crime against humanity, terrorism, violent extremism and domestic violence (UNTFHS, 2009).

The economic insecurity covers persistent poor economy, job insecurity, unemployment, food insecurity and energy security etc. "The economic security is the ability of people to meet their needs consistently. It is connected to both the concept of economic well-being and the notion of the modern welfare state, a governmental entity that commits itself to providing baseline guarantees for its citizens' security" (Mollenkamp, 2022). Community insecurity is considered as a threat to communities and specific human groups due to their common ethnic, religious and traditional identities. The community security which is a subset of human security is defined, a protection against the threat to a community with its ethnic, tribal, traditional or religious identity (Caballero-Anthony, 2015). Lastly, threats to the political security means political repression, human rights abuses, restrictions on political movements and limited access to the justice. It means to ensure that people are well protected from repression by the state and they have all basic human rights as well as rights of speech, press and voting (Shamsi, 2022). This study covers threats to the personal, economic, community and political securities causing brain drain in Pakistan.

The brain drain is a term indicating significant migration or relocation of people from one location to other or from one state to an other. A brain drain can result from political, social and economic instability within a nation and other contributory factors could be attraction of corresponding reward at foreign land for skills possessed or due to an aspiration to pursue a better life as compared with home country. Ultimately, several factors including political turmoil, social and economic insecurity at home or the existence of more favourable professional opportunities elsewhere can be causes of brain drain from one country to other country. Gibson and McKenzie (2011) explored the term brain drain from different perspective, they contend that the term brain drain "is

obviously a loaded phrase, involving implicit definitions of economic and social welfare, and implicit assertions about facts" (Gibson & McKenzie, 2011). According to their assertion, the term carries stronger implications of serious losses. The debate among academics and experts continues over the prospective gains and losses. However, gains are no less significant because latest knowledge can only be transferred through these skilled personnel studying and later working in the advanced countries such as U.S. and European Union's member states. Sometime the brain drain occurs at an organization or industry when employees realize better wages and other financial benefits in other organizations or industries. Reasons for the brain drain could be different and it could be depended upon the situation but it is clear that brain drain causes countries, industries, and organizations to lose a core portion of valuable individuals.

The economic theory categorizing the brain drain both as a good and a bad type of human migration, has been an appropriate approach to be employed to address the question of causes of brain drain from Pakistan. The theory assumes that migration is a bad tendency established on endogenous growth models, wherein main reasons are three-fold (Barrientos, 2007). First, training of skillful individuals is funded by citizens because of their taxes money as competent persons go away from the country, citizens lose their financing used on the training (Barrientos, 2007). Second, assumption for brain drain describes, the skilled people who migrate to other countries are being paid less wages in their own country, therefore they leave for abroad. The value of the services of emigrants in their host country is greater than their actual income at home; services of emigrants are actually less valuable in their home country.

Thus, when skilled persons move to other countries, the home country drops important human resources. Thirdly, these examples allow for misrepresentations in the labour marketplace: a specific pay setting and training financed by the public sphere. Therefore, a prosperity loss especially damage of investment on growth of the individuals takes place when relocation of the people particularly skilled individuals occurs. In case of Pakistan, first and second assumptions are more relevant. First, the country faces the damages of brain drain of the skilled individuals who grow through the huge investment of the state. Second, the professionals leave the country due to economic insecurity such as low wages and high expense in Pakistan.

#### **4. Brain Drain in Pakistan**

Since 1970s, a large number of qualified migrants comprising of engineers, doctors, IT specialists and other professionals who were trained on the government's financial resources or their education took place on self-finance basis, migrated from Pakistan. Their migration to other countries caused shortage of highly qualified professionals in the various home institutions including organizations working in education, health, manufacturing industry and building construction fields. The relocation tendencies show the failure of the government to provide sufficient opportunities and incentives to retain the qualified workers. A report revealed that there was a 50% increase in the number of highly skilled migration from Pakistan to other countries in first decade of 2000s (as compared to the previous decade) and this process continued in the second decade of 2000s as it is verified in a report published by UNESCO

(Sajjad, 2011). The migration in 2002-2008 show the high ratio of skilled and unskilled migrants from Pakistan. According to an article, in 2007, 1800 engineers emigrated to overseas which is almost the 70% of the trained workers migration in 2006 (Sajjad, 2011). The data confirmed the relocation of many of skilled youth from Pakistan and these people were included from possessors of primary education till Master/Ph.D. degree holders. Various factors including economic insecurity caused drain of the brain in Pakistan as it was learned that about 600,000 citizens of this country moved to work abroad only in the year of 2009 (Hewitt, n.d.).

As for the migration of top qualified experts, a government’s institution dealing with the overseas employment revealed in a report that above 36,000 high skilled professionals such as doctors, engineers and academicians turned to foreign countries for attaining a better and nonviolent environment in last three decades, specially this valued intellectual capital’s relocation from the country witnessed an upsurge in the post 9/11 and post Arab spring periods (Tahir et al., 2011). The media reports and reports from other independent sources provide much higher number of the migration of top professionals from Pakistan to other countries in the mentioned period. It has been reported in the media that 432,299 high skilled individuals left Pakistan in last five decades. According to a newspaper, since 1971, 29,939 doctors, 11,968 nurses, 5791 pharmacists, 87,869 engineers, 66,093 accountants, and 230,639 painters/artists left Pakistan for different reasons (Sakina, 2023).

**Table 1: Migration of High Skilled Professionals from Pakistan Since 1971**

Sr No.	Professions	Numbers	Total
1.	Doctors	29,939	
2.	Nurses	11,968	
3.	Pharmacists	5791	
4.	Engineers	87,869	
5.	Accountants	66,093	
6.	Painters/ Artists	230,639	= 432,299

**Source:** *Cited above (Sakina, 2023).*

Beside the other professions, there are also attractive environment for Pakistani physicians abroad. According to a report in 2005, Pakistan had provided about 13,000 medical practitioners to USA, UK, Canada, and Australia (Qureshi & Rathore, 2014). Another report disclosed that above 9,000 officially registered medical doctors left Pakistan only in three years of 2013-2015 (Hassan, 2015). Signifying threats to the personal security as a reason for the doctors’ migration from Pakistan while quoting the police sources, the report unveiled that 26 doctors were killed in Pakistan last year (2014) and these numbers of deaths of the medical practitioners were three times higher than the number in 2010 (Hassan, 2015).

The student’s mobility from Pakistan to abroad is also one of the leading developments concerning the drain of intellectual capital from Pakistan. The migration of young people from Pakistan had increased in 2000s as 24, 671 students in 2006, 36,366 students in 2010 and 49,000 students in 2011 traveled for education to other countries (IOM, 2019). Many of the students tried to settle in the host countries after completion of

their education abroad. Although, between 2002 and 2012, the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Government of Pakistan sent 8,537 students abroad for higher studies but a great majority of students migrated with their own finances or financed by their families (IOM, 2019). As per a research report, a large number of the students at Agha Khan University in Karachi wanted to move abroad due to poor quality of training, infeasible work environment and low wages after training in Pakistan (Afzal et al., 2012). According to the report, some of the students considered terrorism as one of the key causes of migration of highly qualified and brilliant people from the country. The gravity of brain drain can be gauged from the figures quoted by a newspaper that during 2018-2019, 884,000 Pakistanis decided to leave the country, most of them were fresh graduates and skilled individuals (Ahmed, 2019). Currently approximately 60,000 Pakistani students are studying abroad including 7,475 in the US (2020-2021) as reflected in UNESCO statistics dated 29 march 2022 (Ahmed, 2019).

Although, the vast majority of migrant workers from Pakistan to other countries are men but this trend is also increasing among the Pakistani female workers who not only face a sequence of economic and social encounters to get the employment but their safety conditions are also not fair in the country (Khan, 2020a). Beside the migration of skilled workers and students' mobility and female workers too, the tendencies of asylum seeking by Pakistanis in different western countries has also continued. According to the updates of mid-2017, there were 136,527 Pakistanis who applied for asylum in the various countries of the world mostly in the western countries (IOM, 2019). Many of them might be fake applicants of the asylum but some of them may have real human insecurity issues in Pakistan such as personal and community security.

It is true that there was a widespread fear of terrorism and uncertainty among the masses in Pakistan during rise of terrorist activities in the country especially in post 9/11 era. As the terrorists were not hesitating to target the crowded spots during this period, people were commonly avoiding to visit the public gathering places such as bazars. It is fact that as a result of terrorist activities a large number of the people internally migrated to escape terrorist reprisal attacks besides relocating themselves abroad. Target killing of people of the religious minority communities by the violent extremists and terrorists were also among the causes of migration of the qualified professionals like doctors, engineers, scientists, educationalists, manufacturers and entrepreneurs from Pakistan to other countries (Shah & Jamal, 2016). A large number of the people from Hazara-Shia community moved from Pakistan to foreign lands due to rising threats to this ethnic-religious group as the endless genocide of these people by the violent religious and sectarian organizations was reported in 2000s era (Raza, 2018). According to a media report, several hundreds of Hazara have been killed in steadily worsening targeted violence, including bombings in Quetta, the capital of Balochistan province. About 2000 people of Hazara community having their specific facial features have been killed since 1999 in Pakistan (Majeed, 2021). According to this source, more than 500 people of the Hazara community were killed in target killings, suicide attacks and bomb blasts only in four years of 2015-2018 (Majeed, 2021).

Not only Shia community but also other Muslim communities such as Sufi-Sunnis as well as non-Muslim; Ahmadis, Hindus and Christians were also targeted by the violent

extremist groups. The non-Muslim communities, specially Christians were attacked by the fanatic elements with rise of religious militancy in 2000s in Pakistan (Khan, 2005). Attacks of the violent activists on Christian community persisted as its places of worship, educational institutions and health centers were targeted in 2000s. Misuse of an amended blasphemy law of Pakistan has apparently figured out as another problem concerning the religious minorities particularly Christian community. Since 1980s, a number of complaints were registered against members of Christian community on the basis of this law and many of them were charged through this revised rule incorporated in the Constitution of the country in 1986 (Dawn, 2012) . According to the official data, above 11 million Pakistanis who proceeded abroad for employment to over 50 countries have been registered so far and concentration of most of them is Gulf countries including Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates hosting the majority (90% of the total Pakistani expatriates), (ILO, 2019). The remittances by the migrant workers to Pakistan reached to US\$ 21.84 billion during 2019's financial year and 60-65 per cent of these remittances were from the Arab States (ILO, 2019). The years of 2020 and 2021 was the period which badly affected the migration of the Pakistanis to different countries of the world witnessing Covid-19. During the pandemic, not only the brain drain declined while many of the Pakistani workers in different countries were trapped in the host countries including Gulf states due to pandemic related restrictions on travel (Khan, 2020b).

As Covid-19 waves decreased and people started to be vaccinated, the trends of migration from Pakistan once again increased as around 762,000 people left the country for abroad in 2022, nearly triple the 225,000 migrants in 2021 and 288,000 migrants in 2020. As for the demographic representation of migration by the provinces and territories of Pakistan in year 2022, about 424,000 people migrated from Punjab, 206,000 from Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (KP) plus 38,000 from newly-merged tribal districts, 54,000 from Sindh, 27,000 from Azad Kashmir (AJK), 7,000 from Balochistan and 6,000 from Islamabad, the capital territory respectively (Ahmed, 2022).

**Table 2: Demographic Profile-Pakistani Work Force Moving Abroad in 2022**

Demographic Representation by Province/Territory	Number of Migrants
Punjab	42,4000
KP	206,000
Newly Merged Tribal Districts of KP	38,000
Sindh	54,000
Balochistan	7,000
Azad Jammu Kashmir	27,000
Islamabad Capital Territory	6,000
Total migration in 2022	762,000

## 5. Threats to Human Security in Pakistan

This research assumed that the brain drain takes place in Pakistan due to the three main dimensions of the human uncertainty involving economic, personal and community insecurities. The accessible academic efforts also identified political,



economic and human insecurities as of the main reasons for brain drain in Pakistan (Abbas & Guriro, 2018). It is a fact that better work opportunities, safety and quality of life, political stability and social justice attract the highly skilled manpower from developing countries to advanced countries. The issue of migration of the workers is not only related to Pakistan while it is an international problem. The glaring example is large population of Hispanics and Mexicans flocking to the US, and tens of thousands migrating to Western Europe after fall of Soviet Union from Eastern European countries seeking membership of the EU – an economic and political union. Sikh community in Canada is fairly affluent which is pursuing its political goals besides addressing their personal economic insecurity issues. Another example is the recent moving scenes of Ukrainians who left their war ravaged country and sought shelter and work permit in neighbouring countries to alleviate their personal physical and economic insecurity. This research addressed the question of the threats to economic, personal and community securities as main reasons for the brain drain in Pakistan.

The economic security which is one of the crucial aspects of the human security has been assumed as one of the main factors of migration of the skilled and unskilled workers from Pakistan. Better quality of life and jobs opportunities corresponding to their qualification act as incentives for the skilled manpower to migrate to the various countries including U.S. and EU's member states for reaping economic benefits. Specifically, the highly skilled professionals choose to get back financial rewards of the investment that they made by seeking higher technical education in the developed world. Often lack of job opportunities or much lower wages with no recognition of skills dissuade the foreign trained manpower from returning to their home countries. Pakistan being one of the countries whose manpower is mostly semi skilled yet contributes a great deal in foreign remittances especially from Middle East, Europe and the US. Pakistan is a country where due to financial instability and less job opportunities, the employers take extra advantage of their employees and this type of attitude also one of the causes of the migration of workers to other countries having better employment facilities (Mukhtar et al., 2022).

The percentage of skilled manpower is relatively higher in the U.S. and European countries however, Pakistani Diaspora is not willing to repatriate to Pakistan in order to play their role in skill enhancement at home mainly because of personal economic insecurity. According to the aforementioned survey report, 95% of students (of a university) answered to a research questioner that they desire to migrate to the U.S. and European countries due to meager salaries in Pakistan (Abbas & Guriro, 2018). This intension indicates that the economic insecurity is one of the main reasons for intellectual drain in Pakistan. The brain gains by developed world are detrimental to less developed countries' interest whose skilled manpower is induced to migrate under lucrative financial and better life prospects abroad. Pakistan is though gaining financial benefits through remittances so far, skilled professionals being precious national asset in technological development is not available in the country. The trend manifests the urgency of ensuring balance between established necessity of sending promising students to the universities of the West for seeking knowledge and concurrently incentivizing them to return and serve the nation.

The personal security is also one of the concerns of the persons as Human beings and variety of threats to the individuals serve as possible attraction for emigration to developed world where prospects of human security are much brighter. Personal physical security is also of the main reasons for brain drain in Pakistan. Many of the people including highly skilled professional including doctors and engineer migrated from Pakistan to other countries in 2000s era. They were being personally threatened by the violent extremists and terrorist groups particularly after the 9/11 events as Pakistan faced a long-lasting issue of terrorism. Mainly due to deteriorating security situation in Pakistan, many of the scholars studying abroad decide to stay back in their host countries after completion of their academic degrees. It means that beside the economic security, the personal physical security was also of their concerns. Therefore, the questions of human insecurity and prestige is one of the leading causes of brain drain from Pakistan to the developed world.

As for the community security, vulnerabilities to liberty, excesses by criminal gangs and discrimination on account of caste and creed in home countries also attract the people towards efficient system of policing and justice in the developed world. The community security is one of the important aspects of the human security. Threats to the community security happened when a group of the people or a particular community being targeted (by others) due to their specific identity. For example, Palestinian Muslims seek shelter to neighbouring Muslim countries or other countries due to their community security concerns in occupied Palestinian territories. In case of Pakistan, some of the minority communities in the country also choose migration in order to evade perpetual exploitation and threat to their life and property. The immigration of Hazara Shiite community due to rise of terror is a leading example of threat to the community security in the country. This research verified that threats to the community security as main causes of the brain drain because many the people of Shia-Hazara group migrated from Pakistan to the foreign countries including the western countries. Due to fear of terror and violent extremism, many of the Christians and Hindus also migrated from Pakistan to other countries.

## **6. Analysis and Conclusion**

The developed world like U.S. and EU still struggle to fully grasp the phenomena of migration and consequently brain drain or brain gain. Pakistan lies in a region which is overwhelmed by challenges of different kind, let alone imagining launching of some persuasive initiatives to harness the invaluable resource of professionals especially youth which heads towards the West with the hope of better life and job opportunities. With evaluation of academic efforts and study of the circumstances related to brain drain in Pakistan including the local politico-socio-economic environment, the research concluded that there are host of factors which cause pull on brains to developed world.

The affected countries including Pakistan will have to conduct a serious exercise to thoroughly evaluate national policy on education, labour laws, equitable opportunities for all and to have business friendly climate and quality educational institutions otherwise this dilemma of brain drain may persist for decades or even more. The successive governments will have to prioritize education setor on war footings so that the culture of research and development is nurtured and the graduates are in a position to

offere innovative solutions in the fields of technology and business. The technical institutions are operating in void they will have to operate in sync with local industry and futre technological needs.

The personal and community security should also be taken seriously into account. The prevalent precarious economic situation, accentuated by political uncertainty, has further added into flight of brains especially highest in 2022, which is estimated to be 762,000 personnel. Pakisatni skilled and unskilled labour headed towards Western destinations and Middle Eastern countries respectively for better future and a secure life. Pakistan National Securty Policy 2022 rightly identified as human securty as priority one rather than military security, this shift in strategic thinking needs to be capitalized for economic and social rights.

Pakistan as a country should identify the need of talent and devise measures accordingly to retain the youth so that much higher incentives of the West do not pull the talent. There is an urgent need of grasping the supply and demand chains which serve as cause for capacity of job markets for graduates from universities. To convert the disadvantage of brain drain into brain gain, Pakistan along with the underdeveloped countries may adopt a policy that their graduates should return after acquiring planned degrees. The culture of research and development may be constituted by co-opting universities through Higher Education Commission of Pakistan (HEC) and quality projects should be funded and incentivized commercial ventures. IT and E-commerce are possible fields to be tapped.

The personal security is an important dimension of the human security and fear of terror and threat to the life pushed many of the people in Pakistan to leave their homeland. As for the community security, some of the minority communities in Pakistan including Shia-Hazara and non-Muslim minority groups left the country for a secure future in other countries. Thus threats to the personal and community security, as a significant dimension of human security has been identified as one of the of the main factors of the brain drain in Pakistan. The security policies of the state should be revised to ensure comprehensive security to this vital aspect and restore human dignity. While remaining within well-defined parameters of Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, the inalienable right of human security- protection of life, property, socio-economic and above all human dignity should be ensured by the incumbent government(s).

A number of favourable factors for employees such as supervisory support, equality and safety in working environment and respect at workplace can give positive outcomes including increasing productivity, reduced absenteeism, better health of employees, enhancing organizational capability (Rehmat et al., 2021). Such atmosphere may also prevent the rapid relocation of intellectual capital from Pakistan to abroad.

## **7. Limitations**

This study is constrained by some limitations. For the sake of clarity and focus, the time period from 2000 till to 2022 has been concentrated upon due to two major indicators - one post 9/11 security threat emanating in the form of systematic terror campaign against selected communities at home and educated youth deciding to migrate to safer

destinations with promising economic opportunities. Access to some of the confidential official documents related to relevant issues is one of the limitations beside travel to terror infested regions for primary data was not permitted by concerned security officials due to security concerns. The verifiable data available at website of Pakistan Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Pakistani mainly concentrates on demographics and categories of skilled and unskilled labour. The available data on official sources was however, corroborated with the analysis of free lance analysts or opinion pieces appearing in print media. Human security issues do not figure out prominently in any of the official data sources thus was analysed based on migration pattern of hazara community and others to Western countries.

### **Ethical Consideration**

The authors declare that this submission follows the policies of AJSS as outlined in the Guide for Authors and in the Ethical Statement.

### **Informed Consent**

Not applicable

### **Declaration of Interest Statement**

The authors declare that we have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

### **Acknowledgments**

Not applicable

### **Fundings**

Not applicable

## **8. References**

- Abbas, A., & Guriro, S. (2018). Brain drains of business, and it graduates in Pakistan. *Journal of Business Administration and Management Sciences*, 2(2), 316-326.
- Afzal, S., Masroor, I., & Shafqat, G. (2012). Migration of health workers: a challenge for health care system. *Journal of the College of Physicians and Surgeons Pakistan*, 22(9), 586.
- Ahmed, W. (2019, December 20). "Brain Drain: Ten Million Pakistanis out for Greener Pastures". The Express Tribune. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2121628/brain-drain-ten-million-pakistanis-greener-pastures>
- Ahmed, W. (2022). "Country's brain drain situation accelerated in 2022". The Express Tribune. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2390704/countrys-brain-drain-situation-accelerated-in-2022>.
- Arif, G. M., Irfan, M., & Cohen, S. I. (1997). Population Mobility across the Pakistani Border: Fifty Years' Experience. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 36(4), pp.989-1009.
- Baldwin, G.B. (1970). Brain Drain or Overflow? *Foreign Affairs*, 48(2), 358-72.
- Barrientos, P. (2007). *Analysis of International Migration and its Impacts on Developing Countries* (No. 12/2007). Development Research Working Paper Series. Institute for Advanced Development Studies (INESAD).
- Beine, M., Docquier, F., & Rapoport, H. (2008). Brain Drain and Human Capital Formation in Developing Countries: Winners and Losers. *The Economic*

- Journal*, 118(528), 631-652.
- Caballero-Anthony, M. (2015). Community security: human security at 21. *Contemporary Politics*, 21(1), 53-69. Dawn. (2012, September 19). "Timeline: Accused under the Blasphemy Law". Dawn. <https://www.dawn.com/news/750512/timeline-accused-under-the-blasphemylaw>
- Connelly, M., & Hama, H. H. (2017). *Kurdistan's Struggle for Sovereignty: State, Societal, and Human Security*. Arab Center for Research & Policy Studies.
- Fisher, J. P. (2003). Third world brain drain: Brain drain must be halted. *BMJ: British Medical Journal*, 327(7420), 930. ILO. (2019, December). "Labour migration in Pakistan". International Labour Organization. <https://www.ilo.org/islamabad/areasofwork/labour-migration/lang-en/index.htm>
- Gibson, J., & McKenzie, D. (2011). Eight questions about brain drain. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 25(3), 107-128.
- Hassan, S. R. (2015, June 16). "Pakistan doctors live in fear after spike in deadly attacks". Reuters. <https://www.reuters.com/article/cnews-us-pakistan-healthcare-attacks-idCAKBN0OV2SV20150615>
- Hewitt, C. (n.d.). "Pakistan". Cooper Hewitt. <https://collection.cooperhewitt.org/countries/23424922/>
- IOM. (2019, August). "Pakistan Migration Snapshot". International Organization for Migration. <https://dtm.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd11461/files/reports/Pakistan%20Migration%20Snapshot%20Final.pdf>
- Khan, A. U. (2005). *The terrorist threat and the policy response in Pakistan*. Stockholm: Stockholm International Peace Research Institute.
- Khan, T. (2020a). *Female Labour Migration from Pakistan: A Situation Analysis*. International Labour Organization. [https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/labour-migration/projects/reframe/WCMS\\_735795/lang-en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/labour-migration/projects/reframe/WCMS_735795/lang-en/index.htm)
- Khan, T. (2020b, June 20). Migration and mobility during COVID-19: A Pakistan perspective. *Routed magazine*. <https://www.routedmagazine.com/covid-pakistan-perspective>
- Majeed, G. (2021). A Historical Account of Sectarianism in Pakistan and Persecution of Shia Hazara Community of Quetta in Balochistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5(1), 380-392.
- Mollenkamp, D. T. (2022). "Economic Security". Investopedia. <https://www.investopedia.com/economic-security-5213404>.
- Mukhtar, F., Shahid, M., & Khokhar, S. G. (2022). Impact of Financial Condition on Work Life Balance and New Knowledge Acquisition: A Case of Pakistan. *Academic Journal of Social Sciences (AJSS)*, 6(2), 001-024.
- Orton, J. W. (1982). Brain drain of Pakistani professionals in the United States. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 20(1), 30-35.

- Özden, C., & Schiff, M. (Ed.). (2005). *International migration, remittances, and the brain drain*. World Bank Publications, pp.6.
- Qureshi, A. Z., & Rathore, F. A. (2014). Number of Pakistani physicians working abroad; Do we really need to know. *Journal of Pakistan Medical Association*, 64(12), 1410-1412.
- Qureshi, S. M. (1965). Brain drains from the developing countries. *Pakistan Horizon*, 18(2), 164-170.
- Rehmat, M., Abid, G., Ahmed, A., Naqvi, F. N., & Anum, L. (2021). Past and present of thriving at workplace: A nomological network. *Academic Journal of Social Sciences (AJSS)*, 5(1), 73-108.
- Raza, A. (2018). *Identity crisis in the wake of mass migration: A study of identity crisis and acculturation strategies of Hazara diaspora living in Arendal* [master's thesis, Universitetet i Agder; University of Agder].
- Sahay, A. (2009). *Indian Diaspora in the United States Brain Drain or Gain?* New York: Lexington Books, pp.4-6.
- Sajjad, N. (2011). Causes and solutions to intellectual brain drain in Pakistan. *Dialogue*, 6(1), 31-55.
- Sakina. (2023, March 23). "Brain drains in Pakistan: A serious concern". Pakistan Today. <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2023/03/23/brain-drain-in-pakistan-a-serious-concern/#:~:text=Losing%20%20doctors%2C%20%20engineers%2C%20%20scientists%2C,left%20Pakistan%20%20for%20different%20%20reasons>
- Shah, M., & Jamal, H. (2016). Lack of Security: A Major Phenomenal of Brain Drain in District Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *Pakistan. Journal of Accounting & Marketing*, 5(3), 180.
- Shamsi, Z. U. H. (2022, April 19). "Significance of Political Security". Centre for Aerospace & Security Studies. <https://casstt.com/significance-of-political-security/>
- Sinclair, M. (1979). Canadian involvement in the brain drains from Africa: Opportunities for action. *African Issues*, 9(4), 19-25.
- Tahir, M. W., Kauser, R., & Tahir, M. A. (2011). Brain drains of doctors; causes and consequences in Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 5(3), 302-308.
- Truscott, M.H. (1971). *The Brain Drain of Scientists, Engineers, and Physicians from the Developing Countries to the United States* [Doctoral dissertation, Louisiana State University]. Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College ProQuest Dissertations Publishing. [https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool\\_disstheses/2015](https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses/2015).
- UNTFHS. (2009). *Human security in Theory and Practice*. <https://www.unocha.org/sites/dms/HSU/Publications%20and%20Products/Human%20Security%20Tools/Human%20Security%20in%20Theory%20and%20Practice%20English.pdf>